DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 336 381 SP 033 309

AUTHOR Young, Beverly L.; And Others
TITLE The Effectiveness of Teaching Internships as a Viable Route to California Alternative Certification.
PUB DATE Jun 91
NOTE 18p.
PUB TYPE Reports - Descriptive (141)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Alternative Teacher Certification; *Beginning Teachers; College School Cooperation; Comparative Analysis; Elementary Education; Higher Education; *Internship Programs; *Longitudinal Studies; On the Job Training; Program Evaluation; School Districts; Teacher Education; *Teacher Interns
IDENTIFIERS *California

ABSTRACT

One of California's alternative routes to teacher certification is a teaching intern program in a collaborative arrangement between an institute of higher education (IHE) and local school districts. To help determine whether internship programs are a viable alternative for training teachers in the future, a 5-year longitudinal study has been undertaken to explore the possibilities of developmental differences in teaching quality between beginning teachers (recent graduates of a teacher preparation program) and intern teachers during their first 5 years of teaching. In March 1990, 24 beginning teachers and 23 intern teachers were randomly selected from the California State University, San Bernardino campus. These teachers of grades K-6 represent 11 school districts in Southern California. During the first year, a pilot study was conducted to explore the validity of the proposed longitudinal study. The pilot study used a written survey, classroom observation using a specially designed instrument, follow-up telephone interviews, and a follow-up survey on teacher concerns. The preliminary findings show the intern teachers to be at equivalent levels or just slightly behind regularly credentialed beginning teachers in their developmental processes, a finding that, if borne out by the longitudinal study, will have serious implications for credentialing institutions. A list of 19 references and observation and survey data tables are attached. (AMH)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED336381

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF TEACHING INTERNSHIPS AS A VIABLE ROUTE TO CALIFORNIA ALTERNATIVE CERTIFICATION

Beverly L. Young, Ph.D.
California State University, Fullerton

Ruth Anne. Sandlin, Ph.D
California State University, San Bernardino

Belinda Dunnick Karge, Ph.D.
San Diego State University

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

B Karge

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Submitted to ERIC
June, 1991

SP033 309

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

The Effectiveness of Teaching Internships As a Viable Route to California Alternative Certification

United States citizens enjoy the right to free, public education. All children are guaranteed an opportunity to attend school. Historically the education system has been recognized for the high quality of its trained teacher personnel (Hawk & Schmidt, 1989). However, in more recent years, states are facing a critical shortage of qualified teachers.

The importance of having fully qualified teachers in our schools has led to research investigating causes of this teacher shortage. This research implies possible sources of available personnel (Sykes, 1988), gives factors contributing to the shortage of teachers (Baum 1987; Haberman, 1988), and suggests recommendations for the development of more accurate procedures to measure the extent of the shortage (Feiman-Nemser, 1988).

Only on a limited basis does the literature provide longitudinal studies describing the impact of teacher shortages on various preservice and inservice training approaches. The current literature consists primarily of expert opinions and proposals that remain hypothetical due to the virtual lack of efficacy studies which examines such teacher training.

The teacher shortage has prompted states to adopt alternative routes to certification. Current studies find 48 states have implemented alternate route programs (Barr, 1990). Alternate routes are intended to reduce the number of emergency certificates issued, while filling positions with trained personnel.

The American Association of Colleges of Teacher Education Task Force 1984 report on Teacher Certification defines Emergency certification as a program allowing individuals to teach who have not completed the necessary requirements for full certification. Individuals are not assumed to currently possess the necessary qualifications, as in the alternate route programs, nor are they required to enroll in an accelerated program of study. Nationwide, an estimated 200,000, or 13 percent of classroom teachers hold emergency permits (Futrell, 1989). California requires persons with emergency permits to complete only six semester units each year toward renewal of these emergency permits.

Similarly, some states grant waiver status to non-certified persons as a means of filling teaching vacancies. Often a teacher with a waiver has completed only a bachelor's degree. During the 1988-89 school year, 898 individuals taught classes under the California waiver program (Winget, 1989). Additionally, 15 percent of all teachers in California are not fully qualified to serve in their current position because they are teaching under alternative permits (CTC, 1990).

California offers five alternative routes to becoming a teacher. The state offers the following routes to irregular teacher certification: (1) a teaching intern program with an institute of higher education (IHE); (2) the district internship program, formerly the teacher trainee program; (3) the emergency permit; (4) eminence credentials or waivers, a one-year renewable certificate for exceptional cases; and (5) out-of-state credentials by reciprocity or

discretionary review. The Commission on Teacher Credentialling (CTC) has reported that from 1983-1984 to 1988-89 there has been a 139 percent increase in the number of teachers working in general education on the basis of an alternative permit (CTC, 1990).

Of the five California options, the teaching intern program with IHE supervision is the most attractive to school districts due not only to its ability to increase the recruitment and selection options of districts in filling positions, but also because the university and school district share professional responsibility for the intern (Sandlin, Karge, Young, Nix, & Scott, 1989).

Variation exists in the IHE internship programs in the State of California. Most follow fairly standard steps for setting up the internship program. The initial set-up of the internship begins with universities having prearranged agreements with selected school districts for a reciprocal intern program. Under this arrangement universities may declare applicants qualified for internships on the basis of experience and academic merit. On occasion, the school districts may pressure the university to accept a student even if the student does not meet all the university standards or if there has not been a previously arranged contract.

In the latter situation, the school district needs to employ a teacher so desperately that they will try to negotiate a contract for the purpose of employing the particular individual, without the required university prerequisites for the program. Thus the student may secure an internship without being fully qualified; the university and the school district may hastily agree to a partnership

without having made all the necessary arrangements for an effective internship program; and a problem may arise as to when the intern should begin teaching at the designated school site. Some IHE's allow entry in the program at only one specified time of the year. Their entry point usually coincides with the quarter or semester system of that institution and the recruitment needs of a school district. Regardless of the entry point, the intern teacher is given a classroom like any regularly credentialed teacher; he or she goes through the same procedural steps of setting up a classroom for use.

Few studies have been done on the effectiveness of internship programs compared to other regular certification routes. Those that have been done (Oliver & McKibbin, 1985), have only followed teachers for one or two years. The investigators believe longitudinal studies need to be conducted for at least five years and perhaps longer to determine whether in fact, internship programs are a viable alternative in the training of teachers for the future.

Thus, the purpose of this study is to explore the possibilities of developmental differences in teaching quality between beginning teachers and intern teachers during their first five years of teaching in elementary classrooms. This paper will report the results of a first year pilot study and will discuss the design and procedures currently in progress for year two of the longitudinal study.

Method

Subject

In March 1990, twenty-four beginning teachers and twenty-three intern teachers were randomly selected from a pool of intern

students and beginning teachers (recent graduates) from the California State University, San Bernardino campus. Eleven school districts in Southern California are represented.

For the purposes of this paper beginning teacher is defined as a first year teacher who has recently completed coursework toward their credential and has completed traditional student teaching under the direction of a master teacher and a university supervisor The intern teachers in this sample were enrolled in a Teaching Intern Program with an Institute of Higher Education (IHE). This program is defined as a contract among the intern, the university, and the school district. The university agrees to provide the educational coursework, instructional seminars, and classroom supervision of the intern, while the school distict agrees to provide the intern with a salaried classroom teaching position, a district mentor, and district supervision. All of the interns in this study had documentation of two years field experience prior to entering the program and had taught a demonstration lesson for the faculty at the University where their internship was to be fulfilled. These admissions criteria are examples of a more stringent and structured program.

The subjects teach in grades Kindergarten through sixth and range in age from 23 to 46. The class size ranges from 26 to 36, the mean is 28 students. Only one subject has a Master's degree. All others have a Bachelor's degree plus graduate units.

Procedure and Results

The investigators designed a pilot study that would explore the validity of a longitudinal study to compare and contrast the developmental processes of California beginning teachers and intern teachers in their first five years of teaching in elementary classrooms. The design of the pilot study was threefold. 1) written survey, 2) classroom observations, and 3) follow-up telephone interviews. Additionally a follow-up survey on teacher concerns was added in Fall, l990.

Written Survey

A California New Teacher Program Survey was administered to all beginning teachers and all intern teachers. The survey asks for basic demographic data, then requests subjects to rate various concerns on a six point Likert scale, one being low , six , high. The survey explored the issues of teacher satisfaction and sources of support. In general there seemed to be no differences between the level of satisfaction with teaching. However, interns felt more satisfied with the level of support they received in their first year. Intern support included University Supervision, weekly seminars, and coursework as well as district support systems.

Classroom Observations

A protocol for classroom observations was established. A research coordinator contacted the subjects, explained the blind review process, and set up site visits. Reviewers with experience in supervision of teachers visited the subjects' school sites and

conducted on-site observations. Demographic data, perceptions of teaching abilities, and teaching styles were previously collected via written subject questionnaires and self-report questionnaires. The observers only role was to watch and record classroom activity.

After an extensive review of the literature, it was concluded that no existing method for observation and description of classroom activity was suitable for this study. Therefore, an observational instrument utilizing a six point Likert scale was developed. This instrument notes three dimensions of classroom processes: room environment, classroom activity, and classroom discipline. The instrument takes into account all of the Far West Lab Quality Indicators currently being used in the California New Teacher Project observation instruments (Bartell, 1990). Three further aspects of these dimensions are also described: student-teacher interaction, student-student interaction, and on-task behavior. Inter-rater reliability was established at a level of .97. Overall, beginning teachers were scored higher with a mean of 4.830 as compared to an intern teacher mean of 3.125 (Table 1). The individual five items were each consistently higher for the beginning teachers. Items one and two included assessment of environmental factors such as room appearance, bulletin board displays, and traffic patterns. Items three and four assessed teacher involvement with students and students on-task behavior. Item five described evidence of systematic discipline.

The other measure conducted during classroom visits was a time sampling of classroom actions. In all three measures (teacher-student, student-student, and student-on-task) beginning teachers showed a consistently higher percentage of on task activity.

Insert Table 1 about here

Follow-up Telephone Interviews

In addition to the questionnaires and classroom observations the investigators randomly sampled thirty-one percent of the subjects via a structured telephone interview format. The interview questioning protocols were based on paradigms of teacher concerns researched from studies of staff and curriculum development. A standard set of 13 questions were asked. Computation of statistical significance was not possible due to the low number of subjects in this portion of the study. However, the subjects did verbally share several thoughts and ideas that seem to have surfaced as trends.

All subjects reported a successful first year of teaching experience. When asked "what do you feel best about? " the intern teachers indicated curriculum strengths and satisfaction with "making it through the first year." The beginning teachers seemed to express deeper since of accomplishment. They reported feeling confident in their abilities and having a high awareness of staff and administrator support.

Echoing the written survey results, intern teachers praised the amounts of emotional support they received. Also, the intern

teachers did not feel as adequately prepared for the year. While the beginning teachers sought curriculum and time management skills, the interns were requesting information on classroom management, discipline, working with special needs students, and district/administration access and support.

The subjects noted various types of support systems. The interns emphasized the university supervision, and support and criticized the lack of district support. On the other hand, beginning teachers praised site administrators, mentor teachers and district personnel for adequate inservice and consultation.

Follow-up Concern Survey

Finally, a follow-up survey was conducted to assess teacher concerns. The instrument used was taken from the work of Dr. John M. Rogan and modified for the present sample. The scale consists of 60 item stems to be ranked on a six scale Likert. Rogan (1988) had constructed this scale based Francis Fuller's work on the developmental progression of teacher concerns (1974). This conceptualization has persisted unchanged to the present time. Fuller believed the stages of concerns were developmental and related to teacher effectiveness. This hierarchy is delineated into three stages: 1) *Self* - themselves and their own survival; 2) *Task* - actual teaching duties; and 3) *Impact* - related to one's abilities to be successful with students and the teaching- learning process.

The investigators had 20 teachers from the pilot study complete Rogan's concern survey in the Fall of their second year. With such a low number of participants the investigators did not

expect to find quantitative differences between the beginning teacher and intern teacher groups. However, in analyses of variance, 11 of the 60 items were statistically significant (Table 2). Surprisingly, it was found that six of the seven items on which beginning teachers scored significantly higher were *Impact* factor loaded while the four intern items were split between *Task* and *Self* factor concerns. These results encourage further exploration of trends related to intern teacher concerns with *Task* and *Self* items and beginning teachers, *Impact* concern scores. According to Fuller (1974), teachers movement through these stages was not automatic but a product of outside intervention. If this is true these differences may be the direct result of their credential training programs.

Insert Table 2 about here

Longitudinal design

These trends are being further investigated as year two of the study evolves. The subjects initially studied will be "Cohort I". An additional 70 beginning elementary teachers and 70 elementary interns were selected from a pool of California State University students; approximately ten school districts in Southern California are represented.

Demographic data, perceptions of teaching abilities, and teacher concerns have been collected via written subject questionnaires and self-report telephone interviews. Classroom

site visits will again serve as the vehicle for classroom activity data collection. The pilot instrument is undergoing standardization and will be used again.

A nationally standardized performance based teacher evaluation instrument, the Teacher Evaluation Scale (TES), (Hawthorne Educational Services, 1990) will also be utilized. The TES has standardization data reflecting administration to over 2,200 teachers. A Pearson Product Moment Correlation Coefficient of $r=.96$ ($p<.01$,) indicates a substantial degree of test-retest reliability. Additionally inter-rater reliability coefficients range from .91 to .95. The test manual also reports strong content and construct validity.

Conclusions and Implications

The conclusions from this study have potential impact on teacher education programs in general and on alternative teacher certification. In comparing these two groups, it should be expected that intern teachers by definition should demonstrate concerns and competencies associated with more experienced teachers. Adversely, the preliminary findings show them to be at equivalent levels or slightly behind regularly credentialed beginning teachers in their developmental processes, most clearly demonstrated in evidence of levels of developmental progression of teacher concerns. Obviously these results are tentative but if borne out by the subsequent longitudinal study now in progress, serious implications for credentialing institutions may become apparent.

Nationwide teacher shortages mandate alternative teacher preparation programs. However, if these programs result in reducing the potential of promising teacher candidates to a level beneath what would be expected by their experience, then these alternative stopgap credentialing measures are not serving the needs of our schools, they are thwarting them.

References

American Association of Colleges of Teacher Education Task Force on Teacher Certification (1984). Teacher Education policy in the states. Washington, DC: Author. ED 271438

Barr, V. (1990). State emergency certification provisions: Results of a 1990 survey. Washington, DC: NASDSE/CEC, National Clearinghouse for Professions in Education.

Bartell, L. (1990). The California New Teacher Project: Instrumentation and Data Collection. Paper presented at the Annual meeting of American Educational Research Association Conference, Boston, MA.

Baum. (1987) Perceived problems of begining teachers. Review of Educational Research, 54, 143-178.

Commission on Teacher Credentialing (1990). Improving the attractiveness of the teaching profession. Sacramento, California.

Feiman-Nemser, S. (1988). Forms of teacher preparation. Paper presented at the annual meeting of American Educational Research Association, New Orleans, LA.

Fuller, F. (1974). Achieving affective competencies through the teahcer concerns self confrontation model of personalized teacher education. A paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Education Research Association, Chicago.

Fuller, F.F. & Brown, O.H. (1975). Becoming a teacher. In K. Ryan (Ed.). The Seventy-Fourth Yearbook of the National Society for the study of education. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Futrell, M. H. (1989). Revitalizing teacher education: Where do we go from here. Teacher Education Quarterly, 16(2), 33-39.

Gideonse, H. (1984). State education policy in transition: Teacher education. Phi Delta Kappan, 66, 205-208.

Haberman, M. (1984). An Evaluation of the Rationale for Required Teacher Education: Begining Teachers with and without Teacher Preparation. Milwaukee, Wisc: University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, Division of Urban Outreach.

Hawk, P. & Schmidt, M. (1989). Teacher preparation: A comparison of traditional and alternative programs. Journal of Teacher Education, 22, 53-58.

Hawthorne Educational Services (1990). The teacher evaluation scale. Columbia, MO.

McCarney, S. B. (1986). The teacher evaluation scale. Hawthorne Educational Services.

Oliver & McKibbin. (1985). Teacher trainees: Alternative credentialing. California Journal of Teacher Education, 36(3); 20-23.

Rogan, J. M. (1988). Validation of SoC questionnaire. Unpublished paper. Western Montana College.

Sandlin R., Karge, B., Young, B., Nix, S. , & Scott, L.(1989). Teaching Internsips: Are they dooming new teachers to mediocrity? Journal for the California Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 28-32.

Sykes, G.(1988). Implications of the Carnegie and Holmes proposals on future forms of teacher preparation. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Educational Research Associaiton, New Orleans, LA.

Winget, P. (1989). Teacher Shortage critical in Education. Special EDge, 3(9), 1-10.

Table 1
Observation Data

Assessment of Room Environment, Classroom Action, & Discipline: (6 point Likert Scale)

	Beginning Teachers	Interns	
Overall means:	4.830	3.125	
By item:	1 - 4.710	3.250	(Environment)
	2 - 5.000	3.500	(Environment)
	3 - 4.850	2.875	(Teacher action)
	4 - 4.850	2.875	(Student action)
	5 - 4.710	3.125	(Discipline)

Time Sampling Recording of Classroom Action (3 Measures)

Teacher/Student Interactions:

	Beginning Teachers (179 observations)	Interns (109 observations)
On Task	52%	32%
Off Task	48%	68%

Student/Student Interactions:

	Beginning Teachers (133 observations)	Interns (189 observations)
On Task	74%	44%
Off Task	26%	56%

All Student Scan:

	Beginning Teachers (166 observations)	Interns (211 observations)
On Task	80%	53%
Off Task	20%	47%

Table 2
Level of Concern Survey

When I think about teaching am I concerned about this?

Beginning Teacher:

Item	Significance Level	F(df)
(8)IMPACT Increasing students' feelings of accomplishment	.0262	5.870l (l,l8)
(35)SELF Managing my time efficiently	.0991	3.0242 (1,18)
(37)IMPACT Whether students can apply what they learn	.0631	3.9241 (1,18)
(41)IMPACT Understanding ways student health problems affect learning	.0850	3.3214 (1,18)
(42)IMPACT Guiding students toward intellectual growth	.0518	4.3394 (1,18)
(58)IMPACT Meeting the instrucitonal needs of non-English speaking students	.0693	3.7312 (1,l8)
(60)IMPACT Ability to foster feelings of positive self-esteem in students	0727	3.6355 (1,18)

Intern Teacher:

(6)TASK Having too little control over the curriculum	.0l39	7.4250 (1,18)
(21)TASK Too many standards and regulations set for teachers	.0520	4.3291 (1,18)
(26)TASK The inflexibility of the curriculum	1251	2.5880 (1,18)
(27)SELF Having my inadequacies known to other teachers	.0969	3.0668 (1,18)
(57)SELF- Lack of enjoyment of teaching	.0552	4.2023 (1,18)